



RODWAN
—◆—
consulting
company

***City of Livonia
Retiree Health and Disability
Benefits Plan***

Actuarial Valuation as of November 30, 2008



May 26, 2009

The Board of Trustees
City of Livonia Retiree Health and Disability Benefits Plan
Livonia, Michigan 48154

Dear Board Members:

This report contains the results of an actuarial valuation of the City of Livonia Retiree Health and Disability Benefits Plan.

The date of the valuation was November 30, 2008.

The purpose of the actuarial valuation is to:

- Compute the liabilities associated with post-retirement health and disability benefits likely to be paid on behalf of current retired and active participants covered by the Plan, and
- Compute a pre-funding contribution rate for the City to finance Plan benefits as they accrue.

This valuation has been conducted in accordance with generally accepted actuarial principles and practices. Data concerning active members, retirees, beneficiaries and assets was provided by the City of Livonia. This data has been reviewed for reasonableness, but no attempt has been made to audit such information. The valuation was based on the provisions of the Plan as submitted by the City.

Respectfully submitted,

Denise M. Jones
Senior Consultant

Sandra W. Rodwan
Member, American Academy of Actuaries

Table of Contents

Section One: Valuation Summary

Valuation Summary	1
-------------------------	---

Section Two: Actuarial Calculations – Funding

Computed Contribution Rates	3
Actuarial Accrued Liability	4
Comments	5

Section Three: Benefit Provisions

Benefit Provision Summary	7
---------------------------------	---

Section Four: Actuarial Assumptions and Methods

Actuarial Assumptions	11
Actuarial Methods	15

Section Five: Valuation Data

Asset Summary	16
Participant Summary	18





Section One:

Valuation Summary



Purpose of Valuation

The purpose of the annual actuarial valuation of the City of Livonia Retiree Health and Disability Benefits Plan as of November 30, 2008 is to:

- ❖ Compute the liabilities associated with benefits likely to be paid on behalf of current retired and active participants,
- ❖ Compute a pre-funding contribution rate to finance the benefits promised by the Plan as they accrue.

Assumptions Used in the Valuation

The liabilities and pre-funding contribution rate are very sensitive to the long-term assumptions used in making the valuation. The assumptions used in making this valuation, summarized in Section Four, are only one reasonable set out of a large number of possibilities. To the extent that actual experience differs from the long-term assumptions, the liabilities and contribution rates will be greater or less than those indicated in this report. The assumptions having the greatest impact are the rate of medical care inflation and the discount rate. A 6% annual rate for medical care inflation was assumed for the year following the valuation, 5.5% for the next year and 4.75% thereafter. The assumed discount rate for liabilities was 8.25%.

Actuarial Accrued Liabilities

The total actuarial accrued liabilities of the Plan as of November 30, 2008, were computed to be \$122,117,498.

Funding Value of Assets

The funding value of assets as of November 30, 2008 was \$55,360,874. There were no available assets in the Retirement System 401(h) account as of November 30, 2008.

Computed City Contribution Rate

The City's total contribution for Defined Benefit Plan participants was computed to be 12.48% for General Non-Court members, 14.48% for Court members, 14.28% for Police Non-LLSA, 16.28% for LLSA employees, and 12.47% for Fire.

The City's total contribution rate for Defined Contribution Plan participants was computed to be 13.02% for General Non-Court members, 15.02% for Court members, 15.33% for Police Non-LLSA, 17.33% for LLSA employees, and 14.31% for Fire.

Participants

	Defined Benefit Plan	Defined Contribution Plan	Total
Active Participants	236	429	665
Active Participant Payroll	\$16,054,563	\$21,348,355	\$37,402,918
Retired Participants	546	86	632
Inactive Vested Participants	25	10	35



Section Two:

***Actuarial Calculations –
Funding***



City of Livonia Retiree Health and Disability Benefits Plan

Computed City Contribution Rates for the Fiscal Year Beginning December 1, 2009 Based on Alternate Assumptions

At the meeting of the Board on May ²⁷26, 2009, the Board requested that we compute the contribution rates based on the following changes: decrease the assumed investment return rate to 8.0% from 8.25%, decrease the assumed rate of across-the-board salary increases to 4.0% from 4.75%. The assumed rate of medical care inflation was to remain unchanged—6% for this year, 5.5% for next year, 4.75% thereafter.

We have rerun the 11/30/2008 valuation based on the alternate assumptions. The City's computed contribution rates for the year beginning December 1, 2009 based on the alternate assumptions are indicated below.

Unfunded actuarial accrued liability was amortized as a level percent of payroll over 40 years for health insurance and 30 years for disability benefits, as adopted by the Board of Trustees. Both periods are unchanged from last year's valuation. The amortization payment is added to the normal cost to determine the total recommended contribution.

The contribution rate for health insurance should be applied to the combined Defined Benefit Plan and Defined Contribution Plan payroll. The contribution rate for disability benefits should be applied to the Defined Contribution Plan payroll only.

Contributions for	City Contributions Expressed as Percents of Payroll					
	General (Non-Court)		Police (Non-LLSA)		Fire	
	Disability	Health Insurance	Disability	Health Insurance	Disability	Health Insurance
Normal Cost						
Age & service benefits	0.00%	6.10%	0.00%	5.06%	0.00%	4.97%
Disability benefits	0.67	0.16	1.82	0.61	2.43	0.54
Pre-retirement survivor benefits	0.00	0.24	0.00	0.14	0.00	0.14
Termination benefits						
Deferred age & service benefits	0.00	0.81	0.00	1.24	0.00	0.22
Total Normal Cost	0.67	7.31	1.82	7.05	2.43	5.87
Total Amortization Payment	(0.13)	8.45	(0.90)	10.79	(0.59)	10.05
Total Contribution Requirement	0.54	15.76	0.92	17.84	1.84	15.92
Member portion	0.00	2.00	0.00	2.00	0.00	2.00
City portion	0.54%#	13.76%*	0.92%#	15.84%	1.84%#	14.92
City portion-Combined Disability Allowance and Health Insurance						
Defined Benefit Plan Participants (Health only)		13.76%*		15.84%**		13.92%
Defined Contribution Plan Participants (Both)		14.30%*		16.76%**		15.76%
Weighted Average – All Participants		14.16%*		16.14%**		14.64%

Applies only to Defined Contribution Plan participants.

Rodwan Consulting Company

(Revised May 27, 2009)

**These rates apply to the payroll of members who contribute 2%. The employer contribution rates for Court employees who do not contribute are the following. The DB Plan Health only rate is 15.76% instead of 13.76%. The DC rate for health and disability is 16.30% instead of 14.30%, and the weighted average is 16.16% instead of 14.16%.*

***These rates apply to the payroll of Police members who contribute 2%. The employer contribution rates for LLSA employees who do not contribute are the following. The DB Plan Health only rate is 17.84% instead of 15.84%. The DC rate for health and disability is 18.76% instead of 16.76%, and the weighted average is 18.14% instead of 16.14%.*

Recommended City Contribution Rates for the Fiscal Year Beginning December 1, 2009

The City’s computed contribution rates for the year beginning December 1, 2009 are indicated below.

Unfunded actuarial accrued liability was amortized as a level percent of payroll over 40 years for health insurance and 30 years for disability benefits, as adopted by the Board of Trustees. Both periods are unchanged from last year’s valuation. The amortization payment is added to the normal cost to determine the total recommended contribution.

The contribution rate for health insurance should be applied to the combined Defined Benefit Plan and Defined Contribution Plan payroll. The contribution rate for disability benefits should be applied to the Defined Contribution Plan payroll only.

Contributions for	City Contributions Expressed as Percents of Payroll					
	General (Non-Court)		Police		Fire	
	Disability	Health Insurance	Disability	Health Insurance	Disability	Health Insurance
Normal Cost						
Age & service benefits	0.00%	5.95%	0.00%	4.98%	0.00%	4.80%
Disability benefits	0.67	0.16	1.90	0.61	2.41	0.53
Pre-retirement survivor benefits	0.00	0.23	0.00	0.13	0.00	0.13
Termination benefits						
Deferred age & service benefits	0.00	0.80	0.00	1.19	0.00	0.21
Total Normal Cost	0.67	7.14	1.90	6.91	2.41	5.67
Total Amortization Payment	(0.13)	7.34	(0.85)	9.37	(0.57)	8.80
Total Contribution Requirement	0.54	14.48	1.05	16.28	1.84	14.47
Member portion	0.00	2.00	0.00	2.00	0.00	2.00
City portion	0.54%#	12.48%*	1.05%#	14.28%	1.84%#	12.47
City portion-Combined Disability Allowance and Health Insurance						
Defined Benefit Plan Participants (Health only)		12.48%*		14.28%**		12.47%
Defined Contribution Plan Participants (Both)		13.02%*		15.33%**		14.31%
Weighted Average – All Participants		12.89%*		14.63%**		13.19%

Applies only to Defined Contribution Plan participants.

*These rates apply to the payroll of members who contribute 2%. The employer contribution rates for Court employees who do not contribute are the following. The DB Plan Health only rate is 14.48% instead of 12.48%. The DC rate for health and disability is 15.02% instead of 13.02%, and the weighted average is 14.89% instead of 12.89%.

**These rates apply to the payroll of Police members who contribute 2%. The employer contribution rates for LLSA employees who do not contribute are the following. The DB Plan Health only rate is 16.28% instead of 14.28%. The DC rate for health and disability is 17.33% instead of 15.33%, and the weighted average is 16.63% instead of 14.63%.

Revised 5/27/09.

Actuarial Accrued Liabilities

The actuarial accrued liabilities as of November 30, 2008 was computed to be the following:

	<u>General</u>	<u>Police</u>	<u>Fire</u>	<u>Totals</u>
Active and vested inactive participants	\$23,425,594	\$15,019,503	\$6,462,673	\$44,907,770
Retirees and beneficiaries	<u>39,434,797</u>	<u>21,920,465</u>	<u>15,854,466</u>	<u>77,209,728</u>
Total	62,860,391	36,939,968	22,317,139	122,117,498
Less: Valuation Assets	<u>30,249,140</u>	<u>15,354,070</u>	<u>9,757,664</u>	<u>55,360,874</u>
Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liabilities	\$32,611,251	\$21,585,898	\$12,559,475	\$66,756,624

(\$ amounts +000)

Valuation Date November 30	Valuation Value of Assets	Actuarial Accrued Liability	Percent Funded	Unfunded AAL	Annual Covered Payroll	UAAL As a % Of Covered Payroll
2003	\$30,475	\$104,386	29.2%	\$73,911	\$34,084	216.8%
2004	37,690	110,156	34.2	72,465	33,355	217.3
2005	41,987	122,019	34.4	80,032	33,312	240.3
2006	47,673	122,267	39.0	74,594	34,373	217.0
2007	52,802	115,685	45.6	62,883	35,354	177.9
2008	55,361	122,117	45.3	66,756	37,403	178.5

Comments

Comment 1: The annual rates of medical care inflation were assumed to be 6% next year, 5.5% the following year and 4.75% thereafter. These rates include the expected savings from cost savings programs for participants who retire in the future. Higher actual and assumed increases in the medical care inflation rates would result in higher funding requirements.

Comment 2: The decrease in the City's computed contributions reflects the member contributions in the Police (non-LLSA) division and less than assumed increases in reported premium rates, particularly complementary coverage.

Comment 3: The funding value of assets spreads the difference between the actual and assumed rate of return over 5 years. As of November 30, 2008, the funding value was \$55,360,874 and the market value was \$41,090,765. The City's computed contribution rates are likely to increase in the future as the carry-forwards of the FY 07/08 unfavorable experience are recognized over the next 4 years.

Comment 4: The Governmental Accounting Standards Board has issued Statements No. 43 and 45 regarding financial reporting for Postemployment Benefit Plans Other Than Pension Plans (OPEB). One of the items to be reported in the financial statements is the annual required contribution (ARC) of the employer. The contribution includes the normal cost and amortization of unfunded actuarial accrued liability. The maximum amortization period is 30 years.

The amortization periods adopted by the Board of Trustees for the funding purposes of this Plan are 30 years for disability benefits and 40 years for health insurance benefits. The 40 year amortization period produces a contribution that is less than the ARC, and hence would result in a net OPEB obligation in the financial reports.

The table on page 6 shows the computed City contributions assuming a 30 year amortization period is used for health benefits as well as disability benefits.

City Contributions Expressed as Percents of Payroll Based on 30 Year Amortization for Health and Disability						
Contributions for	General (Non-Court)		Police		Fire	
	Disability	Health Insurance	Disability	Health Insurance	Disability	Health Insurance
Normal Cost						
Age & service benefits	0.00%	5.95%	0.00%	4.98%	0.00%	4.80%
Disability benefits	0.67	0.16	1.90	0.61	2.41	0.53
Pre-retirement survivor benefits	0.00	0.23	0.00	0.13	0.00	0.13
Termination benefits						
Deferred age & service benefits	0.00	0.80	0.00	1.19	0.00	0.21
Total Normal Cost	0.67	7.14	1.90	6.91	2.41	5.67
Total Amortization Payment	(0.13)	8.57	(0.85)	10.94	(0.57)	10.27
Total Contribution Requirement	0.54	15.71	1.05	17.85	1.84	15.94
Member portion	0.00	2.00*	0.00	2.00	0.00	2.00
City portion	0.54%#	13.71%*	1.05%#	15.85%	1.84%#	13.94
City portion-Combined Disability Allowance and Health Insurance						
Defined Benefit Plan Participants (Health only)		13.71%*		15.85%**		13.94%
Defined Contribution Plan Participants (Both)		14.25%*		16.90%**		15.78%
Weighted Average – All Participants		14.11%*		16.19%**		14.66%

Applies only to Defined Contribution Plan participants.

*These rates apply to the payroll of members who contribute 2%. The employer contribution rates for Court employees who do not contribute are the following. The DB Plan Health only rate is 16.11% instead of 14.11%. The DC rate for health and disability is 16.65% instead of 14.65%, and the weighted average is 16.11% instead of 14.11%.

**These rates apply to the payroll of Police members who contribute 2%. The employer contribution rates for LLSA employees who do not contribute are the following. The DB Plan Health only rate is 17.85% instead of 15.85%. The DC rate for health and disability is 18.90% instead of 16.90%, and the weighted average is 18.19% instead of 16.19%.



Section Three:
Benefit Provisions



Benefit Provision Summary

Participation Requirements

Participants include all persons in the classified and unclassified service of the City who perform services on a permanent part-time or full-time basis.

Retiree Health Benefits – Defined Benefit Plan Members (Including Members who transferred to the DC Plan)

Eligibility

General Members: 30 years of service regardless of age, or age 55 with 10 years of service. Permanent part-time General members need only 10 calendar years of membership instead of 10 years of credited service.

Police Members
(except Lieutenants
& Sergeants and
Administrators):

25 years of service regardless of age, or age 52 with 10 years of service. (Age 50 with 10 years but less than 25 years of service early retirement).

Police Lieutenants
& Sergeants and
Administrators
Members:

27 years of service regardless of age, or age 50 with 10 years of service. (Age 48 with 10 years but less than 27 years of service early retirement).

Fire Members:

27 years of service regardless of age, or age 52 with 10 years of service (age 50 with 10 years of service early retirement).

All Members:

Receipt of disability retirement benefit or death in service survivor benefit.

Benefits

100% City-paid health insurance coverage is provided to all retirees. Spouse coverage is provided while the retiree is alive. Spouse coverage continues after the retiree's death, until attainment of age 65 (or until death if the spouse is receiving a joint and survivor pension). Children between age 19 and 25 and sponsored dependents may be covered at the participant's expense.

Member Contributions

General (non-Court), Police (non-LLSA), and Fire members contribute 2% of pay.

**Retiree Health Benefits – Defined Contribution Plan Members
(Excluding Members who transferred from the DB Plan)**

Eligibility:

General Members:	Age 55 with 10 years of service.
Police Members (except Lieutenants & Sergeants and Administrators):	25 years of service regardless of age, or age 52 with 10 years of service.
Police Lieutenants & Sergeants and Administrator Members:	27 years of service regardless of age, or age 50 with 10 years of service.
Fire Members:	27 years of service regardless of age, or age 52 with 10 years of service.
All members:	Receipt of disability retirement benefit.

Benefits: A percentage of the premium is paid by the Plan to all retirees who satisfy the above eligibility requirements. Spouse coverage is provided while the retiree is alive, and for life after the retiree's death. The amount of the Plan benefit is described below:

	<u>Age Service Requirement</u>	<u>Percentage of Premium Paid By Plan</u>
General Members:	55 & 10	50%
	55 & 15	60
	55 & 20	75
	55 & 25	100
Police Members (except Lieutenants & Sergeants and Administrators):	52 & 10	50%
	52 & 15	60
	52 & 20	75
	25 years of service	100

	<u>Age Service Requirement</u>	<u>Percentage of Premium Paid By Plan</u>
Police Lieutenants & Sergeants and Administrator Members:	50 & 10	50%
	50 & 15	60
	50 & 20	75
	50 & 25 or 27 years of service	100

	<u>Age Service Requirement</u>	<u>Percentage of Premium Paid By Plan</u>
Fire Members:	52 & 10	50%
	52 & 15	60
	52 & 20	75
	52 & 25 or 27 years of service	100

Member Contributions

General members (non-Court), Police (non-LLSA) and Fire members contribute 2% of pay.

Disability Retirement – Defined Contribution Plan Members Only

Eligibility:

Termination of City employment by reason of total and permanent disability after completing at least 10 full years of credited service. The 10 year service requirement is waived for duty disability.

Amount:

- (1) Disability incurred after age 55: A monthly pension computed in the same manner as Normal Pension (see below) under the City of Livonia Employees Retirement System (Defined Benefit Plan) but based on credited service and Average Final Compensation (AFC) at the time of termination.
- (2) Disability incurred before age 55: A monthly pension computed in the same manner as a Normal Pension under the Defined Benefit Plan but based on AFC at time of termination and the credited service the member would have completed had continued in service until age 55. The minimum duty disability pension payable to age 55 is 75% of AFC. Worker's compensation benefits are offset. For non-duty disability cases, the following limitations apply:

Actual Years of Service	Maximum total Years Used to Compute Benefit	Maximum Benefit As a Percentage of AFC
10-15	20	50.0%
16-20	25	62.5
over 20	30 – or actual service if greater	75.0

The Normal Pension under the Defined Benefit Plan is summarized as follows:

General Members:	2.5% of the member's AFC times years of credited service (maximum is 75% of AFC).
Police members (except Lieutenants & Sergeants and Administrators):	2.8% of the member's AFC times the first 24 years of credited service, plus 7.8% of AFC for the 25 th year of credited service (maximum is 75% of AFC).
Police Lieutenants & Sergeants and Administrators:	2.8% of the member's AFC times years of credited service (maximum is 75% of AFC).
Fire Members:	2.8% of the member's AFC times years of credited service (maximum is 75% of AFC).

Average final compensation (AFC) is the average of the highest annual compensations received during any 3 years of service contained within the 10 years of service immediately preceding retirement, including base salary, longevity, shift differential, paid time off, holiday pay, and payment of accumulated vacation time.

An additional cost-of-living allowance is paid to disability retirees. The monthly amount is determined as follows:

- (1) For disability retirees (except as noted on the following page):
 - (a) \$20 per month for a one-year period commencing one year after retirement.
 - (b) \$40 per month for a one-year period commencing two years after retirement.
 - (c) \$60 per month for a one-year period commencing three years after retirement.
 - (d) \$80 per month for a one-year period commencing four years after retirement.
 - (e) \$100 per month for a one-year period commencing five years after retirement.
 - (f) \$120 per month commencing six years after retirement.

(2) For General disability retirees who retire on or after December 1, 2007:

- (a) \$25 per month for one year period commencing one year after retirement.
- (b) \$50 per month for one year period commencing two years after retirement.
- (c) \$75 per month for one year period commencing three years after retirement.
- (d) \$100 per month for one year period commencing four years after retirement.
- (e) \$125 per month for one year period commencing five years after retirement.
- (f) \$150 per month for one year period commencing six years after retirement.
- (g) \$175 per month for one year period commencing seven years after retirement.
- (h) \$200 per month for one year period commencing eight years after retirement.
- (i) \$275 per month for one year period commencing nine years after retirement.
- (j) \$250 per month commencing ten years after retirement.

(3) For Fire disability retirees who retire on or after December 1, 2007:

- (a) \$20 per month for one year period commencing one year after retirement.
- (b) \$40 per month for one year period commencing two years after retirement.
- (c) \$60 per month for one year period commencing three years after retirement.
- (d) \$80 per month for one year period commencing four years after retirement.
- (e) \$100 per month for one year period commencing five years after retirement.
- (f) \$120 per month for one year period commencing six years after retirement.
- (g) \$140 per month for one year period commencing seven years after retirement.
- (h) \$160 per month for one year period commencing eight years after retirement.
- (i) \$180 per month for one year period commencing nine years after retirement.
- (j) \$200 per month commencing ten years after retirement

(4) For LPOA and Fire disability retirees who retire on or after December 1, 2008:

- a) \$25 per month for one year period commencing one year after retirement.
- b) \$50 per month for one year period commencing two years after retirement.
- c) \$75 per month for one year period commencing three years after retirement.
- d) \$100 per month for one year period commencing four years after retirement.
- e) \$125 per month for one year period commencing five years after retirement.
- f) \$150 per month for one year period commencing six years after retirement.
- g) \$175 per month for one year period commencing seven years after retirement.
- h) \$200 per month for one year period commencing eight years after retirement.
- i) \$225 per month for one year period commencing nine years after retirement.
- j) \$250 per month commencing ten years after retirement

Employee Contributions:

None



Section Four:

***Actuarial Assumptions
And Methods***



Demographic Assumptions

(i) Mortality

1983 Group Annuity Mortality Table

Sample Ages	Value of \$1 Monthly for Life		Future Life Expectancy (Years)	
	Men	Women	Men	Women
50	\$129.26	\$137.15	29.20	34.93
55	122.10	131.79	24.84	30.25
60	112.96	124.67	20.66	25.69
65	101.61	115.46	16.71	21.30
70	88.92	103.82	13.20	17.15
75	75.49	90.28	10.15	13.39
80	62.02	76.23	7.66	10.22

(ii) Rates of Disability

Sample Ages	Percent Becoming Disabled Within Next Year	
	General	Police-Fire
20	0.02%	0.07%
25	0.04	0.12
30	0.07	0.24
35	0.11	0.40
40	0.16	0.55
45	0.20	0.71
50	0.25	0.87
55	0.30	1.03

(iii) Termination of Employment

Service related rates for first 5 years of employment. Age related rates after first 5 years of employment

Sample Ages	Years of Service	% of Active Members Separating Within Next Year		
		General	Police	Fire
All	0	12.00%	13.00%	9.00%
	1	9.50	6.00	6.00
	2	8.50	5.50	5.55
	3	7.50	5.00	4.00
	4	4.00	3.50	3.00
25	5 & Over	4.00	3.50	1.62
30		3.50	3.02	1.40
35		3.25	2.25	0.83
40		2.00	1.44	0.32
45		1.25	0.80	0.18
50		1.25	0.50	0.18
55		0.75	0.50	0.18
60	0.50	0.50	0.18	

(iv) Retirement Rates

**Percent of Active Members Retiring within Year
Following Attainment of Indicated Retirement Age or Service**

Retirement Ages	Age Based			Service Based		
	General	Police	Fire	Service	LPOA	Fire
46	-%	50%	-%	25	50%	
47	45	25	-	26	50	
48	45	25	-	27	50	50%
49	45	25	-	28	50	50
50	45	40	-	29	50	50
51	45	40	-	30 & up	100	100
52	45	25	50			
53	45	25	50			
54	45	25	50			
55	45	25	50			
56	45	25	50			
57	20	25	50			
58	20	25	50			
59	10	25	50			
60	10	100	100			
61	25	100	100			
62	20	100	100			
63	20	100	100			
64	20	100	100			
65	15	100	100			
66	20	100	100			
67	20	100	100			
68	40	100	100			
69 & Up	100	100	100			

Actuarial Method Used for the Valuation

Normal Cost. Normal cost and the allocation of actuarial present values between service rendered before and after the valuation date were determined using an individual entry age actuarial cost method having the following characteristics:

- ❖ The annual normal costs for each individual active participant, payable from date of hire to date of retirement, are sufficient to accumulate the value of the participant's benefit at the time of retirement;
- ❖ Each annual normal cost is a constant percentage of the participant's year-by-year projected covered pay.

Financing of Unfunded Actuarial Accrued Liability. Unfunded actuarial accrued liability was amortized as a level percent of payroll over 40 years for health insurance benefits and over 30 years for disability benefits.



Section Five:
Valuation Data



Summary of Asset Information Submitted for the Valuation**Statement of Assets**

As of November 30, 2008, the net market value of Plan assets was reported to be \$41,090,765.

Revenues and Expenses for the Year Ended November 30, 2008:

a. Revenues		
(i) Member Contributions	\$	912,440
(ii) Employer Contributions		6,218,636
(iii) Investment Income (Net of Expenses)		(14,789,397)
(iv) Other income		<u>304,847</u>
(v) Total Income		(7,353,474)
b. Expenses		
(i) Retirement benefits		15,927
(ii) Post Retirement Health Benefits		5,786,314
(iii) Administrative Expenses		<u>37,202</u>
(iv) Total Expenses		5,839,443

Investment Allocation

The reported asset allocation at market value was as follows:

a. Cash and Short Term		
(i) Cash (incl. Checking/Savings Accounts)	\$	
(ii) Accrued Interest/Dividends		234,806
(iii) Money Market Funds		303,987
(iv) Receivables		769,484
b. Fixed Income		19,976,756
c. Equities		20,838,009
d. Other		none
e. Less accounts payable		<u>1,032,277</u>
f. Net Market Value of Assets as of November 30, 2008		\$41,090,765

Funding Value of Assets

	2007	2008
A. Funding Value Beginning of Year	\$47,673,268	\$52,801,741
B. Market Value End of Year	54,283,682	41,090,765
C. Market Value Beginning of Year	49,299,704	54,283,682
D. Non-Investment Income Net Cash Flow	399,156	1,291,633
E. Investment Income		
E1. Market Total B-C-D	4,584,822	(14,484,550)
E2. Amount for Immediate Recognition (8.25%)	3,949,510	4,409,424
E3. Amount for Phased-In Recognition E1 – E2	635,312	(18,893,974)
F. Phased-In Recognition of Investment Income		
F1. From the Current Year 0.20 x E3	127,062	(3,778,795)
F2. First Prior Year	335,556	127,062
F3. Second Prior Year	43,267	335,556
F4. Third Prior Year	130,985	43,267
F5. Fourth Prior Year	142,936	130,985
F6. Total Recognized Investment Gain	779,807	(3,141,925)
G. Funding Value End of Year A + D + E2 + F6	52,801,741	55,360,874
H. 401(h) Account Assets End of Year	0	0
I. Total Funding Value of VEBA Assets	\$52,801,741	\$55,360,874
J. Market Rate of Return	9.3%	(30.8)%
K. Recognized Rate of Return	9.9%	2.4%

Participant Summary**Retirees and Beneficiaries**

As of November 30, 2008, there were 632 retirees included in the valuation.

	Defined Benefit Plan	Defined Contribution Plan	Total
Number	546	86	632

All Retirees and Beneficiaries - November 30, 2008

Attained Age	General	Police	Fire	Totals
40-44		1		1
45-49		14		14
50-54	4	7	10	21
55-59	39	13	14	66
60-64	68	23	21	112
65-69	59	36	19	114
70-74	51	24	16	91
75-79	66	7	18	91
80-84	49	10	12	71
85-89	33	2	3	38
90-94	8			8
95-99	5			5
Totals	382	137	113	632

**Defined Benefit Plan
All Inactive Vested Participants -
November 30, 2008**

Attained				
Age	General	Police	Fire	Totals
35-39	1	2		3
40-44	4			4
45-49	13		3	16
50-54	6	1		7
55-59	1			1
60-64	1			1
65-69		1		1
70-74	1			1
90-94	1			1
Totals	28	4	3	35

Active Participants

As of November 30, 2008, there were 665 active participants.

	Defined Benefit Plan	Defined Contribution Plan	Total
Number	236	429	665
Payroll	\$16,054,563	\$21,348,355	\$37,402,918
Averages			
Age	46.1 yrs.	46.6 yrs.	46.4 yrs.
Service	18.2 yrs.	8.4 yrs.	12.0 yrs.
Salary	\$68,028	\$49,793	\$56,245

**Total Active Members - November 30, 2008
Age and Service Distribution**

Attained Age	Service							Totals	
	0-4	5-9	10-14	15-19	20-24	25-29	Over 30	No.	Payroll
20-24	14							14	\$ 388,849
25-29	34	5						39	1,769,916
30-34	19	12	5					36	2,076,240
35-39	19	24	35	5				83	5,168,233
40-44	23	11	16	43	18			111	6,851,949
45-49	21	19	14	21	38	11		124	7,856,281
50-54	38	20	8	24	13	17	5	125	6,527,944
55-59	18	13	14	13	11	1	5	75	3,925,790
60-64	10	15	6	8	1		2	42	2,066,211
65-69	2	5		3	2	1		13	663,839
70-74			1	1			1	3	107,666
Total	198	124	99	118	83	30	13	665	\$37,402,918

Group Averages:

Age: 46.4 years
Service: 12.0 years
Annual Pay: \$56,245

Defined Benefit Plan
Active Members - November 30, 2008
Age and Service Distribution

Attained Age	Service							Totals	
	0-4	5-9	10-14	15-19	20-24	25-29	Over 30	No.	Payroll
30-34		4	5					9	\$631,668
35-39		3	33	5				41	2,897,972
40-44			13	32	16			61	4,507,312
45-49		1	7	15	34	6		63	4,393,478
50-54			3	13	10	10	1	37	2,328,510
55-59			2	6	9	1		18	910,889
60-64				4				4	223,830
65-69				1	1			2	119,797
70-74				1				1	41,107
Total		8	63	77	70	17	1	236	\$16,054,563

Group Averages:

Age: 46.1 years
Service: 18.2 years
Annual Pay: \$68,028

**Defined Contribution Plan
Active Members - November 30, 2008
Age and Service Distribution**

Attained Age	Service							Totals	
	0-4	5-9	10-14	15-19	20-24	25-29	Over 30	No.	Payroll
20-24	14							14	\$388,849
25-29	34	5						39	1,769,916
30-34	19	8						27	1,444,572
35-39	19	21	2					42	2,270,261
40-44	23	11	3	11	2			50	2,344,620
45-49	21	18	7	6	4	5		61	3,462,812
50-54	38	20	5	11	3	7	4	88	4,199,442
55-59	18	13	12	7	2		5	57	3,014,901
60-64	10	15	6	4	1		2	38	1,842,381
65-69	2	5		2	1	1		11	544,042
70-74			1				1	2	66,559
Total	198	116	36	41	13	13	12	429	\$21,348,355

Group Averages:

Age: 46.6 years
Service: 8.4 years
Annual Pay: \$49,763

Inactive Vested Participants

As of November 30, 2008, there were 35 inactive vested participants.

	Defined Benefit Plan	Defined Contribution Plan	Total
Number	25	10	35

**Defined Benefit Plan
All Inactive Vested Participants -
November 30, 2008**

Attained Age	General	Police	Fire	Totals
35-39	1	2		3
40-44	4			4
45-49	13		3	16
50-54	6	1		7
55-59	1			1
60-64	1			1
65-69		1		1
70-74	1			1
90-94	1			1
Totals	28	4	3	35